

June 2, 2015

Hon. Kathleen Wynne Premier of Ontario Legislative Building Queen's Park Toronto ON M7A 1A1

Dear Premier Wynne,

Thank you for your continued engagement with Ontario employers as you move forward with the design of the Ontario Retirement Pension Plan (ORPP). As you know, many employers are concerned with your government's proposed approach to tackle challenges related to retirement savings. We, the Ontario Chamber of Commerce (OCC), and our members and partners, believe the ORPP will have unintended negative consequences for the province's economy. A recent survey of OCC members found that only 26 percent of employers in the province believe they can shoulder the financial burden associated with the ORPP.

As such, we applaud your government for recently committing to conduct a cost-benefit analysis of the ORPP, as the OCC had requested. This is a good first step in determining the impact that the ORPP will have on Ontario's economy.

This pending cost-benefit analysis notwithstanding, Ontario employers remain concerned that the ORPP will harm Ontario's economy and will penalize employers and employees that are contributing to a secure retirement future.

We, the Ontario employer community, are sending you this letter at a pivotal moment in the development of the ORPP. In May, your government passed ORPP enacting legislation. Over the coming months, your government will design the final parameters of the plan. As such, we are writing to express our serious concerns over the proposed definition of pension plan 'comparability' as outlined in your Ontario Retirement Pension Plan consultation document from December 2014.

Set for introduction in 2017, the ORPP will see employees and employers contribute 1.9 percent each (3.8 percent combined) on an employee's annual earnings up to \$90,000. There are some indications that only certain workplace pension plans will be considered 'comparable' to the ORPP, namely Defined Benefit and Target Benefit Multi-Employer Pension Plans. Employers who offer 'comparable' workplace savings plans will be exempt from contributing to the ORPP.

We support the government's policy objective—to tackle the undersaving challenge and help all Ontario workers save for retirement. However, we do not believe the ORPP is the right tool to solve the problem. Further, a narrow definition of comparability would have serious consequences for the retirement savings landscape and savings in Ontario.

First, the ORPP penalizes employers who are already investing in their employees' retirement savings. Many employers already contribute to their employees' retirement savings through a variety of plans, which include Defined Contribution (DC) plans, group Registered Retirement Savings Plans (group RRSPs), and group Tax Free Savings Accounts (group TFSAs), among others. These plans often involve contribution levels above those stipulated for the ORPP; for example, the average company contribution rates to DC plans and group RRSPs in Canada are 5.2 percent and 4.3 percent, respectively.

Second, by adding costs to employers that already contribute to robust workplace retirement savings plans, the government will counteract its desired goal of increasing Ontarians' retirement savings. For example, employers who offer non-comparable retirement savings plans might choose to reduce the contributions in these plans to offset the new costs incurred by the ORPP. In fact, according to a survey conducted by Environics Research, 66 percent of Ontario companies may consider eliminating their existing DC or group RRSP plans if the ORPP is introduced. The same survey found that 78 percent of companies are likely to reduce contributions to their workplace retirement plan.

Third, the ORPP could erode the three pillars approach to the retirement income system in Canada by replacing private with public savings. Most of the workplace retirement savings plans made available to Ontarians by the private sector are non-comparable under the government's preferred definition. In fact, over 2.4 million Ontarians are covered by plans that the government has deemed non-comparable. Reduced demand for these savings plans brought on by the ORPP could disrupt the balance of public-private savings in the province.

Given these concerns, we strongly urge your government to expand its definition of pension plan comparability to include capital accumulation plans, including (but not limited to) Defined Contribution plans.

As currently designed, the ORPP would take a universal, rather than a targeted approach, to what is a narrow undersaving problem. According to recent analyses by the federal Working Group on Retirement Income Adequacy and McKinsey & Company, a large majority of Canadians and Ontarians are on-track to maintain their standard of living in retirement. In a comprehensive survey of Canadian households, McKinsey estimates that 83 percent of households in 2014 are on track to maintain or exceed their level of consumption in retirement. The ORPP is a blanket solution to a narrow undersaving problem, a problem that many employers have addressed by offering workplace pension plans.

Expanding the definition of comparability would help to mitigate the impacts that the ORPP will have on employers who are already investing in the retirement savings of their employees. As you will see, the Ontario Chamber of Commerce has reached beyond its membership for co-signatories to this letter. The number and diversity of co-signatories reflects the widespread concerns of Ontario's employer community.

We look forward to working constructively with you over the coming weeks and months as you continue to define the parameters of the ORPP.

Sincerely,

Allan O'Dette

President & Chief Executive Officer Ontario Chamber of Commerce

Allan Ogeth

CC:

Hon. Mitzie Hunter, Associate Minister of Finance (Ontario Retirement Pension Plan)

Hon. Charles Sousa, Minister of Finance

Below follows the coalition of signatories that endorse our position.



CHAMBERS OF COMMERCE/ BOARDS OF TRADE

Kathy McKay
Executive Director

Ajax-Pickering Board of Trade

Gerald Meenye General Manager

Greater Barrie Chamber

of Commerce

Bill Saunders

Chief Executive Officer

Belleville & District Chamber

of Commerce

Todd Letts

Chief Executive Officer

Brampton Board of Trade

Colleen Miller

Chair Chamber of Commerce

**Brantford Brant** 

Keith Hoey President

**Burlington Chamber of Commerce** 

Greg Durocher

President & Chief Executive Officer

Cambridge Chamber of Commerce

Perrin Beatty

President & Chief Executive Officer

Canadian Chamber of Commerce

Roberta Scarrow General Manager

Centre Wellington Chamber of Commerce

Gail Bishop

President & Chief Executive Officer

Chatham-Kent Chamber

of Commerce

Lezlie Strasser Executive Manager

Cornwall Chamber of Commerce

Jason Small President

Flamborough Chamber

of Commerce

Kithio Mwanzia

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Guelph Chamber of Commerce** 

Rosemarie Jung

Manager

Haliburton Highlands Chamber

of Commerce

Kathleen Dills General Manager Halton Hills Chamber

of Commerce

Keanin Loomis

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Hamilton Chamber of Commerce** 

Adam Ward President

**Hanover Chamber of Commerce** 

Ann Campbell
General Manager

Ingersoll District Chamber

of Commerce

Suzanne Delorme-Gauthier

President

Iroquois Falls & District Chamber

of Commerce

Carlee Hakenson

Manager

Kenora & District Chamber

of Commerce

Martin Sherris
Chief Executive Officer

Greater Kingston Chamber

of Commerce

Ian McLean

President & Chief Executive Officer

Greater Kitchener Waterloo Chamber of Commerce

Wendy Parsons General Manager

Leamington District Chamber

of Commerce

Gerry Macartney

Chief Executive Officer & General

Manager

**London Chamber of Commerce** 

Sandy Martin Executive Director

Milton Chamber of Commerce

Sheldon Leiba

President & Chief Executive Officer Mississauga Board of Trade

Debra Scott

President & Chief Executive Officer

Newmarket Chamber of Commerce

Jake Lacourse President

North Bay & District Chamber

of Commerce

Kevin Ward

President & Chief Executive Officer Northumberland Central Chamber

of Commerce

John Sawyer President

Oakville Chamber of Commerce

Bob Malcolmson Chief Executive Officer & General Manager

Greater Oshawa Chamber

of Commerce

Ian Faris

President & Chief Executive Officer
Ottawa Chamber of Commerce



Bert Loopstra

President & Chief Executive Officer

Owen Sound & District Chamber

of Commerce

Stuart Harrison

President & Chief Executive Officer **Greater Peterborough Chamber** 

of Commerce

Bree Nixon

Manager Port Hope & District Chamber

of Commerce

Suzanne Andrews General Manager

**Quinte West Chamber** 

of Commerce

Leslie Whidden Chief Executive Officer

Richmond Hill Chamber

of Commerce

Rory Ring

President & Chief Executive Officer

Sarnia Lambton Chamber

of Commerce

Joanne Robbins General Manager

Saugeen Shores Chamber

of Commerce

Shelley Barich

General Manager Sault Ste. Marie Chamber

of Commerce

Anne Shropshire

President

Smiths Falls & District Chamber

of Commerce

Geraldine Fitzsimmons General Manager

South Dundas Chamber

of Commerce

Stephen Boles President

South Huron Chamber

of Commerce

Marianne Braid Manager

Southeast Georgian Bay **Chamber of Commerce** 

**Bob Hammersley** 

President & Chief Executive Officer

St. Thomas & District Chamber

of Commerce

Garry Lobsinger General Manager

Stratford & District Chamber

of Commerce

Debbi Nicholson

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Greater Sudbury Chamber** 

of Commerce

Charla Robinson

President

Thunder Bay Chamber

of Commerce

Suzanne Renken Chief Executive Officer

Tillsonburg District Chamber

of Commerce

Janet De Silva

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Toronto Region Board of Trade** 

Jeff Hamilton

President

Trent Hills & District Chamber

of Commerce

Lorraine McKenzie **Executive Director** 

Upper Ottawa Valley Chamber

of Commerce

Rosemary Leu **Executive Director** 

West Ottawa Board of Trade

Tracy Hanson

Chief Executive Officer

Whitby Chamber of Commerce

Matt Marchand

President & Chief Executive Officer

Windsor-Essex Regional **Chamber of Commerce** 

Martha Dennis General Manager

**Woodstock District Chamber** 

of Commerce

Carol Prang President

**Zurich & District Chamber** 

of Commerce



**EMPLOYERS** 

Rose Gage

Chief Executive Officer

Ag Energy Cooperative Ltd.

Blake Goldring

Chairman & Chief Executive Officer

**AGF Management Limited** 

Joe Loparco Co-President

**AGS Automotive Systems** 

& Tiercon

Felix JE Comeau

Chairman & Chief Executive Officer

**Alcohol Countermeasure** 

Systems

Anthony Agostino

President & Chief Executive Officer

AMG - Agostino Media Group

Tony Bota

Country Head, HR

Amgen

Scott Maki

Vice President, Finance

ArcelorMittal Dofasco

Ed Dybka

President & Chief Executive Officer

AstraZeneca Canada Inc.

Marie Rose Dubois

President

B & D Manufacturing

Andrew Burns

Partner/Business Development

**BDA Insurance Team** 

Phillip Brown

President & Chief Executive Officer

Brown's Fine Food Services Inc.

Michael Medline

President & Chief Executive Officer Canadian Tire Corporation, Ltd.

Owner

Chrissy's Catering

Marcel Rosehart

lan McCormack
Founder and Principal

Compass

Melodie Mason

Director, Total Rewards

**CSA Group** 

Shane Curtis

President

Curtis Wilcox

Dave Peters President

Fresident

Distinctive Alternative

Investments

Kassandra Way

Manager

E & E McLaughlin Ltd.

lan Otaviana

Ian Stevens

Chief Executive Officer

Execulink Telecom Inc.

Lori Shalhoub

Vice President & General Counsel

FCA Canada

Kelly McGiffin

President & Chief Executive Officer

First Ontario Credit Union

Dianne Craig

President & Chief Executive Officer

Ford Motor Company of Canada

Ron Foxcroft

Chief Executive Officer

Fluke Transportation and

Fox 40 Whistle

Mike Perovich President

Future Transfer Co. Inc.

Evelyn Foo

Chief Operating Officer & Chief

Financial Officer

Galileo Global Equity Advisors Inc.

Anthony Mancini

Country HR Manager - Canada

Gates Canada Inc.

Ross Hornby

Vice President, Government

Relations & Policy

GE Canada

Stephen K. Carlisle

President & Managing Director

General Motors of Canada Limited

Michael Boone

Chief Financial Officer

Glencore Canada Corp.

Scot Bolton

Wealth Management Advisor

Good Redden Klosler LLP

Mike Booth

Vice President

Grassmere Construction Ltd.

Paul Mahon

President & Chief Executive Officer

Great-West Lifeco Inc.

Rene Veillette

Managing Director

Halla Visteon Climate Control

Canada & Direct Ship Operations

Teresa Ahuja

Director, Administration

**Hay Group Limited** 



Eric DenOuden President Hill Homes

Patrick Horgan
Vice President, Manufacturing,
Development & Operations
IBM Canada Ltd.

Jason Yohemas Chief Financial Officer Inovata Foods Corp.

Mark Ristow Vice President, Finance

ITW Canada

Brett Tanner
Ontario Marketing Director
Johnston Group

Patti Marsh Controller **KDM Erectors** 

Richard Koroscil
President & Chief Executive Officer

Korlon Strategic Services

Korion Strategic Services

Kathleen A. Waters
President & Chief Executive Officer
Lawyers' Professional Indemnity
Company (LAWPRO®)

Marc Neeb
Chief Human Resources Officer
and Executive Vice President,
Global Human Resources
Magna International Inc.

Donald Guloien
President & Chief Executive Officer **Manulife Financial** 

Rory McAlpine Senior Vice President, Government & Industry Relations

Maple Leaf Foods Inc.

Tyler Wood Account Executive

Marwood Metal Fabrication

Limited

Bill Maurin

President & Chief Executive Officer Meridian Credit Union

Shelley Martin
Chief Executive Officer
Nestlé Canada Inc.

Todd Cooney President

Nestlé Purina Petcare Canada

Debbie Moore President

Nestlé Waters Canada

Cedric Tomico President **NuDecor Inc.,** 

Kelly P. Edmonds

Lawyer

**Only Family Matters** 

John Adams Chief Executive Officer Primerica Financial Services Canada

Dan Pio
Executive Vice President, Strategy

& Business Development

**Progressive Waste Solutions** 

Ron Renkema

Director - Compensation and

Benefits

Rexel Canada Electrical Inc.

Janice Winton
Vice President, Administration

Ryerson University

and Finance

Sabine Schleese

Director of Corporate Affairs

Schleese Saddlery Services

Scott Smith Principal

Scott Smith Edwards HR

Sean M. Driscoll Chief Executive Officer Sentry Investments

Tracy Nutt Owner

Service Master of Sudbury, Build North Construction Inc.

Sandra Hunter HR Manager

SEW-Eurodrive Company of Canada Ltd.

Robert Hardt

President & Chief Executive Officer

Siemens Canada Ltd.

Kevin McCaughen

Canadian Operations Manager Sigma Stretch Flim of Canada

John Sleeman Founder and Chairman Sleeman Breweries Ltd.

Janice Sidney

Senior Director, Total Rewards

& Payroll

Sodexo Canada

Margaret Schwager Owner, Business Manager Sofalvi Door Systems

Shane Carter President

Sony Music Entertainment Canada Inc.



Peter Ballantyne

President & Chief Executive Officer

Stackpole International

John Kirkland President

Verne's Carpet One Floor

& Home

Gerrard Stubbe General Manager Stubbe's Brandsource Home Furnishings

Paul Donnelly Controller Vipond Inc.

Dean Connor

President & Chief Executive Officer

Sun Life Financial

Bob Hakeem

Chief Administrative Officer

Walmart Canada

Leah Heywood

Human Resources Manager

Supersucker Hydro Vac

Service Inc.

Steve Kane President

Warner Music Canada

Rob Thompson

Managing Director

Systemair Inc.

Jason Wilcox Vice President

Waste Solutions Canada

Jim Lopez

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Tembec** 

Gitta Kulczycki

Vice President, Resources

and Operations Western University

Charlie Mason

General Manager, Landing Systems Oakville Operations

UTC Aerospace Systems -

**Landing Systems** 

Gary Power

Vice President & General Manager

Jennifer Maki

Chief Executive Officer

Vale Canada

Whirlpool Canada LP



**ASSOCIATIONS** 

Frank Swedlove

President & Chief Executive Officer

Canadian Life and Health **Insurance Association** 

Ian Howcroft

Vice President, CME Ontario

Canadian Manufacturers & Exporters

Bonnie Patterson

President & Chief Executive Officer Council of Ontario Universities

Sandra L. Kegie

**Executive Director** Federation of Mutual

**Fund Dealers** 

Bill Greenhalgh Chief Executive Officer

**Human Resources** 

**Professionals Association** 

Nancy Allan **Executive Director** 

Independent Financial Brokers

of Canada

Joanne De Laurentiis

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Investment Funds Institute** 

of Canada

Ian Russell

President & Chief Executive Officer **Investment Industry Association** 

of Canada

Brian Lewis

President & Chief Executive Officer

**MEDEC** 

Graham Henderson

President

Music Canada

Don McCabe President

Ontario Federation of Agriculture

Chris Hodgson President

**Ontario Mining Association** 

Patricia Verge President

**Ontario Real Estate Association** 

Tony Elenis

President & Chief Executive Officer Ontario Restaurant Hotel and

Motel Association

Ted Wigdor

Chief Executive Officer

Ontario Stone, Sand, and

**Gravel Association** 

Janet Ecker

President & Chief Executive Officer

**Toronto Financial** Services Alliance

Todd Bourgon

**Executive Director** Trillium Automobile

**Dealers Association** 

## **About the Ontario Chamber of Commerce**

economic growth in Ontario by advocating for pro-business policies and defending business priorities at Queen's Park.

opportunities, and access to innovative insight and analysis. We represent local chambers of commerce and boards of trade from communities across Ontario.

Through this network we are the voice of 60,000 members that range from small businesses to major corporations and

